

**Planning Committee/Recycling Board  
Members**

Grace Liao, **President**  
Source Reduction Specialist

Tracy Jensen, **First Vice President**  
ACWMA

Virginia Harrington, **Second Vice President**  
Solid Waste Industry Representative

Ben Barrientos, ACWMA

Xouhoa Bowen, ACWMA

Ellen McClure, Environmental Educator

Laura McKaughan, Recycling Materials  
Processing Industry

David Mourra, ACWMA

Elaine Owyang, Environmental Organization

Jeff Wang, ACWMA

Vacant, Recycling Programs

Timothy Burroughs, Executive Director

**AGENDA**

**MEETING OF THE  
PLANNING COMMITTEE  
AND  
ALAMEDA COUNTY RECYCLING BOARD**

**THURSDAY, FEBURARY 13, 2025**

**6:00 P.M.**

***IN-PERSON MEETING LOCATION***  
**WETA Central Bay Operations**  
**670 W Hornet Ave, Alameda, CA**

This meeting will be conducted in a hybrid model with both in-person attendance and teleconference participation:

- Teleconference location #1 118 Glashaus Loop, Emeryville, CA
- Teleconference location #2 40087 Mission Blvd. #361, Fremont, CA
- Teleconference location #3 710 Cornell Avenue, Albany, CA
- Teleconference location #4 1534 Ashby Avenue, Berkeley, CA
- Teleconference location #5 1285 Glen Drive, San Leandro, CA

Members of the public may attend in person at the addresses listed above or by:

1. Calling US+1 669 900 6833 and using the Webinar ID 852 6180 9129
2. Using the [Zoom](#) website or App and entering meeting code 852 6180 9129

During the meeting the chair will explain the process for members of the public to be recognized to offer public comment. The process will be described on the StopWaste website at <http://www.stopwaste.org/virtual-meetings> no later than noon, Thursday, February 13, 2025.

The public may also comment by sending an e-mail to [publiccomment@stopwaste.org](mailto:publiccomment@stopwaste.org). Written public comments will be accepted until 3:00 p.m. on the day prior to the scheduled meeting. Copies of all written comments submitted by the deadline above will be provided to each Board Member and will be added to the official record. Comments will not be read into the record.

In accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting due to a disability, please contact the Clerk of the Board at (510) 891-6517. Notification 24 hours prior to the meeting will enable the agency to make reasonable arrangements to ensure accessibility to this meeting.

## **AGENDA**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

**II. ROLL CALL OF ATTENDANCE**

**III. ANNOUNCEMENTS BY PRESIDENT**

**IV. OPEN PUBLIC COMMENT**

An opportunity is provided for any member of the public wishing to speak on any matter within the jurisdiction of the Board but not listed on the agenda. Each speaker is limited to three minutes.

**Page**

**V. CONSENT CALENDAR**

**1**      **1. Approval of the Draft PC&RB Minutes of January 9, 2025**

**3**      **2. Board Attendance Record**

**5**      **3. Written Report of Ex Parte Communications**

**VI. REGULAR CALENDAR**

**7**      **1. Measure D Overview & Five-year Audit Award of Contract (Jennifer West & Meri Soll)**

That the Recycling Board approve this contract award and authorize the Executive Director to enter into a funding agreement with Crowe LLP for the Financial Five-year Audit, for a total not-to-exceed amount of \$227,000. \$110,000 will be awarded from the approved FY 2024-25 budget for Phase I of the scope of work. Upon satisfactory completion of Phase I, the remaining \$117,000 will be allocated from the FY 2026-27 budget and will be included in the FY 2026-27 budget resolution.

**9**      **2. Technical Assistance for Low-Embodied Carbon Building Materials (Heather Larson & Karen Kho)**

This item is for information only.

**VII. MEMBER COMMENTS AND COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR**

**VIII. ADJOURNMENT TO PC&RB MEETING – MARCH 13, 2025 AT 4:00 P.M.**

DRAFT

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE  
PLANNING COMMITTEE  
AND  
ALAMEDA COUNTY RECYCLING BOARD**

**Thursday, January 9, 2025**

**4:00 P.M.**

***IN PERSON MEETING LOCATION:***  
**STOPWASTE BOARD ROOM**  
**1537 WEBSTER STREET, OAKLAND, CA**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

President Liao called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. Timothy Burroughs explained the meeting process being utilized during the meeting. A link to the process is available here: [Virtual-Meetings-Instructions](#).

**II. ROLL CALL OF ATTENDANCE**

Grace Liao, Source Reduction Specialist (President)  
Virginia Harrington, Solid Waste Industry Representative  
Tracy Jensen, ACWMA  
Ellen McClure, Environmental Educator  
Laura McKaughan, Recycling Materials Processing Industry  
David Mourra, ACWMA  
Elaine Owyang, Environmental Organization  
Jeff Wang, ACWMA  
Vacant, Recycling Programs

**Staff Present:**

Timothy Burroughs, Executive Director  
Alma Freeman, Communications Manager  
Justin Lehrer, Operations Manager  
Pat Cabrera, Administrative Services Director  
Jennifer Luong, Financial Services Manager  
Arliss Dunn, Clerk of the Board

**Others Participating**

Mitesh Desai, Badawi & Associates  
Samo Michel, Badawi & Associates

**III. ANNOUNCEMENTS BY THE PRESIDENT**

There were none.

**IV. OPEN PUBLIC COMMENT**

There were none.

**V. CONSENT CALENDAR**

- 1. Approval of the Draft PC & RB Minutes of December 12, 2024**
- 2. Board Attendance Record**

### **3. Written Report of Ex Parte Communications**

There were no public comments for the Consent Calendar. Board member McKaughan moved for approval of the Consent Calendar. Board member Harrington seconded, and the motion carried 8-0. The Clerk called the roll:

(Ayes: Harrington, Jensen, Liao, McClure, McKaughan, Mourra, Owyang, Wang. Nays: None. Absent: None. Abstain: None)

## **VI. REGULAR CALENDAR**

### **1. Fiscal Year 2023-24 Audit Report (Pat Cabrera & Jennifer Luong)**

Staff recommend that the Recycling Board accept and file the FY 23-24 audit report.

Timothy Burroughs introduced the item. Jennifer Luong provided an overview of the staff report. A link to the report is available here: [FY23-24-Audit-Report.pdf](#). Ms. Luong acknowledged administrative and finance staff for their efforts in managing the Agency's finances to ensure a clean audit with no exceptions or recommendations for improvements in internal controls. Mitesh Desai and Samo Michel, from Badawi and Associates were available to answer any questions. Ms. Luong stated that the Agency first submitted our financial report to the GFOA for excellence in financial reporting in FY 2021-22. The Agency has received an award each year and has submitted its financial report again this year.

Additional time was provided to the Board for discussion and for clarifying questions. An audio link to the discussion is available here: [FY23-24-Audit-Discussion](#). The finance team will continue monitoring pension funding status and consider additional discretionary payments during the next budget process if deemed necessary. There were no public comments for this item. President Liao commended staff for their efforts in managing the Agency's finances and extended congratulations for a clean audit report.

Board member McKaughan moved for approval that the Recycling Board accept and file the FY 23-24 audit report. Board member Jensen seconded, and the motion carried 8-0. The Clerk called the roll:

(Ayes: Harrington, Jensen, Liao, McClure, McKaughan, Mourra, Owyang, Wang. Nays: None. Absent: None. Abstain: None)

## **VII. MEMBER COMMENTS AND COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR**

Mr. Burroughs announced the new round of equipment grants that was launched this week. The application deadline is February 24, 2025. There are three categories of grants that are available: surplus food donation equipment grants, reusable transport packaging equipment, and reusable foodware grants. Staff will email the information and asked that the Board assist with spreading the word about these opportunities. A link to the website is available [here](#).

Board member Jensen stated that during the major storms that happened over the holidays, thousands of pounds of microplastics washed up on the shoreline near Alameda Point. Alameda Public Works was able to collect and dispose of it, but it was really disturbing. A link to the article is available [here](#).

## **VIII. ADJOURNMENT – TO PC&RB MEETING - FEBRUARY 13, 2025 AT 6:00 P.M. WETA Central Bay Operations, 670 W Hornet Ave, Alameda, CA**

The meeting adjourned at 4:20 p.m.

**2025 - ALAMEDA COUNTY RECYCLING BOARD ATTENDANCE**

	J	F	M	A	M	J	J	A	S	O	N	D
<b>REGULAR MEMBERS</b>												
B. Barrientos												
X. Bowen												
V. Harrington	X											
T. Jensen	X											
G. Liao	X											
E. McClure	X											
L. McKaughan	X											
D. Mourra	X											
E. Owyang	X											
J. Wang	X											
<b>INTERIM APPOINTEES</b>												

Measure D: Subsection 64.130, F: Recycling Board members shall attend at least three fourths (3/4) of the regular meetings within a given calendar year. At such time, as a member has been absent from more than one fourth (1/4) of the regular meetings in a calendar year, or from two (2) consecutive such meetings, her or his seat on the Recycling Board shall be considered vacant.

X=Attended

A=Absent

I=Absent - Interim Appointed

***This page intentionally left blank***

**DATE:** February 13, 2025  
**TO:** Recycling Board  
**FROM:** Timothy Burroughs, Executive Director  
**SUBJECT:** Written Reports of Ex Parte Communications

---

**BACKGROUND**

Section 64.130 (Q)(1)(b) of the Alameda County Charter requires that full written disclosure of ex parte communications be entered in the Recycling Board's official record. At the June 19, 1991 meeting of the Recycling Board, the Board approved the recommendation of Legal Counsel that such reports be placed on the consent calendar as a way of entering them into the Board's official record. The Board at that time also requested that staff develop a standard form for the reporting of such communications. A standard form for the reporting of ex parte communications has since been developed and distributed to Board members.

At the December 9, 1999 meeting of the Recycling Board, the Board adopted the following language:

*Ex parte communication report forms should be submitted only for ex parte communications that are made after the matter has been put on the Recycling Board's agenda, giving as much public notice as possible.*

Per the previously adopted policy, all such reports received will be placed on the consent calendar of the next regularly scheduled Recycling Board meeting.

***This page intentionally left blank***





**DATE:** February 13, 2025

**TO:** Planning Committee/Recycling Board

**FROM:** Jennifer West, Program Manager  
Meri Soll, Senior Program Manager

**SUBJECT: Measure D Overview & Five-year Audit Award of Contract**

**SUMMARY**

[Measure D](#) (The Alameda County Waste Reduction and Recycling Initiative Charter Amendment) was approved by Alameda County voters in 1989 with the goals of reducing waste, promoting recycling, and setting a path toward ambitious landfill diversion targets for the county. The measure takes a unique and comprehensive approach to waste reduction and environmentalism by addressing a wide range of topics with multiple benefits, from residential recycling programs to mitigating the effects of climate change, along with prohibiting incineration as a waste management solution in the county. The measure created the Alameda County Source Reduction and Recycling Board to oversee implementation of these goals.

Measure D also established the “Recycling Fund,” a surcharge on solid waste disposed of in Alameda County which is collected by landfill operators. These funds, administered by the Recycling Board, total around \$9.7M annually. StopWaste, on behalf of the member agencies, oversees many activities across the focus areas specified in Measure D, while half of the funds are disbursed to member agencies to support their local sustainability efforts. You can read more background about Measure D in our [Topic Brief](#).

Measure D requires an audit every five years to ensure compliance with its requirements. This audit is completed by a firm with whom the Recycling Board executes a contract. Subsection 64.040 (C) of the Alameda County Waste Reduction and Recycling Initiative Charter Amendment (Measure D) mandates a comprehensive financial, statistical, and programmatic audit and analysis to be performed within four years of the effective date of the Act and every five years thereafter to monitor and report on compliance by the appropriate various agencies of Measure D. The financial five-year audit period was divided into two phases of three years and two years, so as to make records review of the municipalities less onerous. The programmatic five-year audit is conducted during the second phase of the financial audit and it is integrated into the financial audit to reduce duplicative efforts. The last Financial Audit covered FY 2016-17 through FY 2020-21 and was completed in October 2022. At the February 13, 2025, meeting, the Recycling Board will be asked to approve a contract to perform the next Measure D Five-year Audit which will include both Financial and Programmatic elements, conducted in two phases. Staff recommend awarding the contract to Crowe LLP.

## **DISCUSSION**

In November 2024, staff released a Request for Proposals (RFP) to identify qualified proposals and consultants to perform a comprehensive financial review of funds raised and spent in fiscal years 2021-22 through 2025-26 as well as a programmatic audit for the same time frame. This review will be performed in two phases: Phase I to be performed in 2025 covering FY 2021-22 through 2023-24 (three years); and Phase II to be performed in 2027 covering FY 2024-25 and 2025-26 (two years). Phase II will also include a programmatic audit for the five-year period. A final report will be compiled for all five years.

In Fiscal Year 2024-25, \$110,000 was budgeted for the Phase I work. The RFP scope of work includes:

- Review audited financial statements, recycling budgets and program descriptions of the 16 municipalities receiving Recycling Fund disbursements to determine compliance with Measure D fiscal requirements.
- Review audited financial statements of the County of Alameda General Services Agency for 5% Recycled Product Purchase Preference Program (RPPP) and of the Recycling Board to determine compliance with Measure D fiscal requirements.
- Review recycling programs of the Recycling Board, Alameda County and Municipalities.
- For all of the above, develop recommendations for improvements, if any, indicated in current policies, procedures and practices.

After proposal review and in-depth interview with principal staff members, Agency staff selected the team from Crowe LLP based upon the proposed management structure for the project and the communications skills of the team members. In addition, Crowe's primary project staff proposed for this contract have worked on the previous Five-year Audit providing continuity and experience with Measure D processes and procedures. A copy of the full Crowe proposal can be accessed [here](#).

## **RECOMMENDATION**

That the Recycling Board approve this contract award and authorize the Executive Director to enter into a funding agreement with Crowe LLP for the Financial Five-year Audit, for a total not-to-exceed amount of \$227,000. \$110,000 will be awarded from the approved FY 2024-25 budget for Phase I of the scope of work. Upon satisfactory completion of Phase I, the remaining \$117,000 will be allocated from the FY 2026-27 budget and will be included in the FY 2026-27 budget resolution.



---

**DATE:** February 13, 2025

**TO:** Programs & Administration Committee  
Recycling Board

**FROM:** Heather Larson, Program Manager  
Karen Kho, Principal Program Manager

**SUBJECT:** **Technical Assistance for Low-Embodied Carbon Building Materials**

---

## **SUMMARY**

Accelerating construction innovation and a clean energy transition in buildings is one of the Agency's three strategic goals. The State of California updated its 2024 building code (CalGreen) to include measures that reduce the embodied carbon of buildings, which encourages waste reduction, material reuse and circular economy strategies in the construction sector. To advance implementation of the new state code, StopWaste is offering technical assistance to municipal and multifamily design teams that seek to incorporate low-embodied carbon building materials in projects. On February 13, staff will present an overview of this program.

## **BACKGROUND**

Embodied carbon refers to the greenhouse gas emissions caused by building construction and the supply chain to produce building materials. According to the World Green Building Council (WGBC), carbon emissions attributable to buildings make up 39 percent of total global emissions, and close to a third of this amount comes from embodied carbon. California is the first state to amend its statewide building codes to include requirements to reduce embodied carbon emissions. This move rewards building reuse and the sourcing of recycled, bio-based, and other low-carbon materials. Multiple studies have shown that building reuse is associated with significant reductions in embodied carbon emissions when compared with new construction. Building and material reuse cuts down on the continual consumption of natural resources, energy and water-intensive industrial processes, and greenhouse gas emissions. Bio-based building products are made from renewable feedstocks such as wood from forest thinning for wildfire prevention, straw, hemp, and bamboo, as opposed to non-renewable resources typically used in today's construction.

## **DISCUSSION**

While CalGreen’s inclusion of embodied carbon is an encouraging step, the code only addresses commercial buildings larger than 100,000 square feet and schools larger than 50,000 square feet. There is still a lag in the implementation of strategies, industry awareness, and market demand for reused and circular building products. To enable the code and other embodied carbon policies to be enforceable and reach more buildings, the Agency’s Built Environment team has rolled out a new technical assistance program. Municipal and multifamily projects (new construction, major rehabilitation and interior renovation) in Alameda County are eligible to receive technical assistance to integrate low embodied carbon materials in project design.

Engaging with projects early in their design phase will enable the incorporation of recommendations in the construction specifications, bid documents and final implementation in construction. This new offering was promoted through the Energy Council Technical Advisory Group, the East Bay chapter of the American Institute of Architects and other industry partners. Staff selected four initial participants from a pool of 10 applications. Some applicants remain in the pipeline but were too early in the planning and finance stages for immediate engagement. The initial projects are:

- **Martin Luther King Jr Youth Services Center, City of Berkeley**

- Architect: Siegel and Strain Architects
- Owner: City of Berkeley
- Description: Renovation of the existing 10,655 SF Facility. Originally constructed in 1950, the community center includes a gymnasium, staff offices, and multi-function program rooms. Construction includes a seismic retrofit, accessibility upgrades, reconfiguration of program spaces, all new MEP systems and the addition of fire alarms and sprinklers.
- Scope of assistance: Low-carbon concrete specs, insulating wood roof and dew point analysis, salvaged wood, used furniture, porcelain tile options, Salvage Assessment Survey
- Phase at time of application: Design Development

- **Mixed-Use Development at 1718 San Pablo Avenue, Berkeley**

- Architect: Arkin Tilt Architects
- Owner: Celery Design Collaborative
- Description: New mixed-use multi-family residential and commercial infill project on a small lot in Berkeley targeting net zero embodied and operational carbon. The project is comprised of two new structures adjacent to the existing structure at 1718 San Pablo Ave (the existing structure will receive a few modifications).
- Scope of assistance: Low carbon concrete specifications, rice hull technical support, Life Cycle Assessment (LCA)/embodied carbon calculations
- Phase at time of application: Design Development

- **Christie Avenue Affordable Housing Development, City of Emeryville**
  - Architect: David Baker Architects (DBA)
  - Owner: EAH Housing is the developer, and the City of Emeryville is the landowner
  - Description: The project is a 3-phase affordable housing development with 362 units overall. Each phase is ~100-130 units spread across three 8-story buildings.
  - Scope of assistance: Low carbon concrete specs, insulation options, cladding options, salvage wood referral, Salvage Assessment Survey
  - Phase at time of application: Planning Entitlement
  
- **Embodied Carbon Purchasing Specifications, Alameda County General Services Agency**

Instead of providing consultation for an individual construction project, the scope of work for Alameda County GSA is to develop purchasing specifications that can be used throughout their portfolio. This work is being coordinated with the Recycled Content Product Purchasing project utilizing Measure D funding. Alameda County GSA will use technical assistance to develop the specifications in collaboration with other member agencies and promote their use through environmentally preferable purchasing roundtables.

This technical assistance offering is not only designed to assist individual projects with the adoption of low-embodied carbon and waste reduction strategies, it also supports a larger market development strategy for circular building materials. Case studies of flagship projects will be shared through industry networks to demonstrate the feasibility of incorporating these materials and practices. Leveraging the Agency’s role in the Bay Area Regional Energy Network (BayREN), staff will coordinate embodied carbon strategies with programs targeting operational energy savings in municipal and multifamily buildings. Direct engagement with project design teams, owners and contractors allows us to better understand barriers to code adoption and the incorporation of innovative products and practices. Lessons learned from the participating projects will inform local and state policy recommendations, such as expanding CalGreen to additional building types.

**RECOMMENDATION**

This item is for information only.